

In einer Reihe von Fällen hätte man in den Anmerkungen unter KA (= Κοινὴ Ἀλβανικῇ) auch die literatursprachlichen Formen, welche den bei M.B. verzeichneten Einheiten eher entsprechen, als Dubletten erwartet, z.B. hätte bei *fare* (41) unter KA neben *krejt* auch *fare* angeführt werden sollen, ebenso (1173) neben *çerdhe* auch *fole*, (47) neben *i papjekur* auch *aguridh*, -e, (251) neben *orimë* auch *birë*. Alle diese Wörter sind im neuesten normativen Wörterbuch des Albanischen (Fjalor i gjuhës së sotme shqipe, Tiranë, 1980) als literatursprachlich anerkannt. Weiterhin verzeichnet, wenn auch als veraltet markiert, sind in diesem Wörterbuch die von T.J. gleichfalls nicht angeführten Synonyme *i syrgjynosur* zu *i internuar* (177), *bajrak* zu *flamur* (178) usw.

Der Wert des Buches wird noch dadurch gesteigert, daß T.J. unter anderem Listen der griechischen, türkischen und anderer Lehnwörter im albanischen Wortgut bringt, das interessante Wortmaterial der beiden genannten Ortsmundarten in Griechenland alphabetisch auflistet und sowohl das Manuskript M.B.s als auch die Handschrift Pouquevilles in technisch einwandfreien Faksimilewiedergaben beilegt.

So gebührt Titos Jochalas das Verdienst, in der vorliegenden, prächtig ausgestatteten Ausgabe für die Albanologie und Balkanologie ein hochwertiges Denkmal erstmals mit philologischer Akribie erschlossen zu haben.

Berlin (DDR)

ODA BUCHHOLZ, WILFRIED FIEDLER

David E. Bynum (ed.), *Serbo-Croatian Heroic Songs*. Vol. 6, Collected by Milman Parry (Cambridge: Harvard Univ. Press, 1980), pp. 334. Vol. 14, Collected by Milman Parry, Albert B. Lord, and David E. Bynum (Cambridge: Harvard Univ. Press, 1979), pp. 529.

Each of these two volumes of original oral epic material occupies a distinct and invaluable place within the Texts and Translations Series of the ongoing Publications of the Milman Parry Collection. A living archive, this collection is the result of a unique research project formulated by Milman Parry almost half a century ago. Through the efforts of his successors, the original project has grown into an intensive intellectual enterprise. This has consisted of several scientific expeditions to the Balkans in order to collect heroic songs over a thirty-year period (from 1933 to 1963), and of the subsequent process of translating and interpreting the texts and circumstantial information pertaining to them obtained in the field. The material results of this project possess value in direct proportion to the high degree of scholarly integrity, precaution and methodological self-awareness followed since its beginning. The publication of the fruit of this intensive labor has continued since the appearance of the first volume in this series in 1954, issued jointly by Harvard University and the Serbian Academy of Sciences.

The initial inspiration that led to the collection of these South Slavic oral epic texts was the result of the chance interaction of refined logical rigor in classical literary scholarship and the development of modern empirical methods in the study of oral poetry. As a student in Paris during the 1920s, Parry analyzed the style of epithets in the Homeric texts and formed a general conclusion about the nature

of epic composition: the high degree of formulaic style in Homer must be traditional. Thus far, he was taking the immediate elements observed in his analytical studies as fundamental principles; the set concepts such as «formula» and «tradition» according to which he deduced his data were themselves induced from the grapho-centric bias of the literary scholar. At this point there occurred one of those fortuitous instances of intellectual contact that mark the fortunate evolution of man's theoretical endeavors. Just as Parry was concluding his studies at the Sorbonne, a series of lectures on Yugoslav folk epics was given there by Matija Murko, the Slovene Slavist who held the Chair of South Slavic Languages and Literatures at Charles University in Prague. Through this exposure to recent investigations of a still living corpus of heroic songs, he came to understand the essentially oral character of traditional epic style. Thus, the very concept of tradition, which had been a fundamental objective «given» of epic as initially studied by Parry, itself came under active consideration and qualification. Henceforth, the exemplary objects of investigation were to be the subjective circumstance of formulaic singing. Epic tradition itself could now be treated as the collective rubric for specific acts of oral composition.

Parry had been led to make the same kind of «inductive leap» in the field of epic scholarship as had been taken by Bacon in physics and Darwin in biology. As long as the literary researcher regarded each specific heroic song as a discrete instance of performance within a fixed epic tradition, his theoretical considerations could only proceed from the viewpoint of the singer himself, who regarded the event of the song as isometric with the structure of the collective oral lore it presented. But once Parry came to regard the concept of epic performance itself as explicable, a structural theory of oral poetry became the conceptual framework, and so the way was cleared for the analysis of heroic poetry in terms of the dynamics of oral composition manifested during performance.

Parry undertook extensive fieldwork in Yugoslavia, where a tradition of epic performance was still alive, in order to collect a body of evidence as the basis for an exact characterization and understanding of oral style in general and the formulaic nature of Homeric style in particular. During two trips made between 1933 and 1935 he succeeded in gathering in hand or electronically recorded form almost seven hundred oral epics performed by more than a hundred carefully selected singers in two dozen locations throughout Macedonia, Serbia, Montenegro, Bosnia and Hercegovina. Following Parry's premature death in 1935, texts were added to the collection as a result of field trips made in 1950 and 1951 by Albert Lord, who continued the project, and in 1963 by Lord and Bynum.

By carefully formulating his criteria for selecting singers, Parry was able to record those with a substantial repertory who had considerable singing experience and who enjoyed a firm reputation among their peers. Volume Six of the series contains two songs from Avdo Medjedović, a Montenegrin Moslem and one of the most exceptionally fluent and talented oral epic singers: *Ženidba Vlahinjić Alije* (The Wedding of Vlahinjić Alija), in two versions, one spoken for dictation, the other sung and recorded; and *Osmanbeg Delibegović i Pavičević Luka*. This second song was recorded entirely by phonograph and is distinguished by being the longest continuous text of oral poetry to be found in any European tradition since Homer. Its length of 13,326 verses makes it somewhat longer than *The Odyssey* and shorter than *The Iliad*. The remarkable circumstances of the production of

this song illustrate both the painstaking inventiveness of Parry's experimental scholarly technique and the creative integrity of Avdo's flexible oral epic technique. The singing of the song was intentionally interrupted and the singer caused to sing three completely different epics and to converse about other epics and events of his own life before resuming and completing the song many days later. Nevertheless, his extraordinary capacity to compose this complex, richly detailed verse epic freely and unaffected by such disturbances is apparent from the rapid rate of his composition: during the eleven hours of performance, he produced more than twenty epic lines per minute, or one every three seconds.

The precise, explanatory information given by David Bynum in his prolegomena qualifies this volume as an important part of a working series which will aid further research into oral epic theory. The burden of each intricately plotted story, both of which are set in the sixteenth century at the time of the Ottoman Emperor Suleiman the Magnificent, is carefully elaborated. The presence of Iliadic echoes and the Achillean type common to many epic stories in the Yugoslav tradition are pointed out in the second song. (The heroine, who is the world's most beautiful woman, is Jela, the Serbo-Croatian for 'Ἑλένη; Luka, the hero, is habitually called *slavni*, a Serbo-Croatian equivalent and etymological cognate of the Homeric epithet *κλειτός*). Other useful editorial helps are: the use of italics devised to indicate phonic or morphological features at variance with the common language and to denote stylistic peculiarities of the oral singer's performance; graphic use of spaced lines to reflect as accurately as possible any unusual fluctuation in the speed of the oral performance; and detailed textual notes explaining idiosyncracies of rhetorical style and versification and irregularities in narrative logic (*lapsi mentis*), delivery (*lapsi linguae*), and composition (*lapsi metricus*). Words of foreign derivation, especially Turkisms, are translated and obscure terms are meticulously explained. The specialist, even of modern Serbo-Croatian, would benefit from a more thorough glossing of dialectal and idiolectal diction (such as Avdo's unusual use of *majdan*, noted in line 7431 of the second song). The usefulness of these songs to the non-specialist will be greatly increased when the English translations of the texts are published in the fifth volume of the series.

Volume Fourteen presents the oral epic tradition of the district of Bihać in northern Bosnia, which is the sixth center of Parry's field collecting. It contains eight complete epics from four traditional singers. The texts are edited so as to illustrate certain main facts about this tradition and a 75-page prolegomenon offers the latest considerations about the genesis of the poetry, the singers, the singing, and the songs. Bynum's comments about the feasibility of an autochthonous Balkan oral narrative tradition ascending to the time of the Homeric epics are cautious, in keeping with the state of modern scholarship, which lacks a coherent theoretical pattern upon which to base the conclusions of finite observations. The editing has been done with extreme respect for the sung presentation and with the conviction that the integrity of the epic is «composition *during* oral performance». In contrast to most Serbo-Croatian oral tradition, the singing of Bihać is not stichic hut strophic. The present volume is the first publication in the hundred-year history of scholarship on the subject to recognize this fact and to document it with a textual format that indicates this. Melodic analyses based on painstaking graphic plotting of the rhythmic delivery reveal the extent to which the accentual and metrical discipline of a particular singing style is distinct from that in the cul-

ture apart from it even as it exhibits universal principles of composition. In providing synopses of the songs, Bynum usefully illustrates the processes of multiformity and modulation as vital mechanisms of oral tradition. This volume contains a multiform cognate of the lengthiest narrative presented in Volume Six, which gives the researcher a unique opportunity to compare different texts of the same tale collected by Parry.

There is primary material here for the student of musicology, linguistics, anthropology, folklore, and many other disciplines. One may wish to approach the oral epic text as a basis for investigating melodic structure, phonetic distribution, metrical form, diction, rhetorical imagery, compositional technique, thematic coherence. Or one may choose to study information about the epic performers, the performing process, or the social milieu of the performance. Whether the particular approach is intrinsic or extrinsic, it is the concept of tradition that qualifies these heroic songs as both oral and epic. Through this denominator of «hand ing down», the act of telling and the form of the told become indistinguishable from one another in the *common instant*. The notion of tradition makes this synthesis paradoxical, one that is both concrete and abstract. The oral epic is concrete by virtue of the eminence of a process of live, immediate verbal transmission in the present; it is abstract by virtue of the immanence of a storied state of the past re-told. But it is this duality that has led to a new, productive formulation of the Homeric Problem. No longer is the epic narrative seen as owing its existence either to the vatic virtuosity of a *sui generis* literate «genius», or to the fabricative ingenuity of an amorphous collective of common «folk». Its properties are not those of a finished product, but of the processes of poetic language stylized — according to the mimetic exigencies of live, social presentation — by a unique individual who is both *poeta vates* and *poeta faber*. The oral epos is created from the interaction between the idiolect of the rhapsode and the intellect of the ethos. It is a result of the cultural contract between singer and society, between invention and convention. On the one hand, it owes its existence to the inventive drive of the singer and to the listeners' demand for interesting invention. On the other, it is governed by the performer's aesthetic necessity so sely on a conserving mnemonic capacity to remember conventionally and by the audience's conservative need to re-experience a story communally through its thematic stability.

The Parry Collection is an important laboratory, one in which we have been educated to understand in time the timeless vitality and the sophisticated potential of a particular form of creative human expression. Homer led to its founding, and the study of the body of material it contains leads us back to Homer as the foundation, the eponymous ἀοιδός, of heroic singing.

Harvard University

RALPH BOGERT

Alexandru Dușu, *European Intellectual Movements and Modernization of Romanian Culture*, Bucharest, Editura Academiei, 1981, 195 p. (Bibliotheca Historica Romaniae, 64).

L'intérêt particulier du nouveau livre d'Alexandru Dușu consiste dans l'effort