

Constantinos K. Chatzopoulos

**The Bulgarians in the Greek Textbooks of History  
of the Second Half of the 19th Century\***

During the last ten years, due to the political changes in the Balkan Peninsula, an increasing interest among the scholars has been observed to study the textbooks of history either used in the past or in use today in the schools of primary and secondary education. The fact that the textbooks of history were and still are written according to guidelines prescribed by the state led the scholars to the conclusion that the official ideology is clearly reflected in these books<sup>1</sup>. Therefore it is very interesting to study when, why and how the negative stereotypes of the “other” —especially of the neighbour— were created.

In the case of Greece till the end of the 1970's the Bulgarians — along with the Turks— were described in the textbooks of history as the “eternal enemies” of the Greek nation<sup>2</sup>. So, it was a common belief among the Greeks that between the Greek and the Bulgarian people there was always a long lasting hostility, which very often led to bloody wars starting with the byzantine era till the 20th century.

Thanks to an essay written in 1926 by Dimitris Glenos, the eminent Greek pedagogist, and published recently by the Greek historian Philippos Eliou<sup>3</sup>, we know today that this negative stereotype concerning the

\* This paper was first presented in a shorter form at the Greek-Bulgarian Symposium held in Thessaloniki on 18-19 of February 1994 and organised by the Faculty of Philosophy of Aristotle University of Thessaloniki and “Climent Ohridski” University of Sofia.

1. Ephe Avdela, *Ιστορία και σχολείο* (History and school), Athens 1998, pp. 40-46.

2. Nikos Achles, *Οι γειτονικοί μας λαοί, Βούλγαροι και Τούρκοι, στα σχολικά βιβλία ιστορίας Γυμνασίου και Λυκείου* (The Bulgarians and the Turks, our neighbouring peoples, in the history textbooks of secondary education), Thessaloniki 1983, pp. 33-39. Cf. Stephanos Papadopoulos, “Η διδασκαλία της βουλγαρικής ιστορίας στα ελληνικά Πανεπιστήμια και τα σχολεία μέσης εκπαίδευσης (The teaching of the bulgarian history in the greek Universities and the schools of secondary education)”, in *Δωδώνη. Επιστημονική Επετηρίδα της Φιλοσοφικής Σχολής του Πανεπιστημίου Ιωαννίνων* 9 (1980) 116-122.

3. Philippos Eliou, “Σχολικά εγχειρίδια και εθνικισμός. Η προσέγγιση του Δημήτρη Γληνού (Textbooks and nationalism. Demetres Glenos' approach)”, published in *Η*

Bulgarian people was first appeared in the Greek textbooks of history at the beginning of the 20th century<sup>4</sup>.

In 1980 Nadja Danova and Gunnar Hering proved that the Greek scholars of the 18th and the first half of the 19th century had a totally different opinion about the Bulgarian people<sup>5</sup>. According to the last two historians, the Greek authors of history books in that period of time considered the Bulgarians, as well as all the other Orthodox people of the Balkan Peninsula, to be their “brothers”. At the same time they admitted that the Bulgarians consisted “un peuple à part, possédant sa propre histoire, sa langue et sa culture spécifique”<sup>6</sup>.

The conception of the “brotherhood” among the Balkan people was created during the long lasting period of Ottoman occupation, because of the common faith and the fact that all the subjects of the Ottoman Empire who were Orthodox Christians were considered to belong to the *Roum-Millet*<sup>7</sup>. An important role to the creation of this conception was also played by the Greek education promoted either by the Oecumenical Patriarchate —till the 18th century— or the Greek Enlightenment —especially during the second half of the 18th and the beginning of the

*Ελλάδα των Βαλκανικών Πολέμων 1910-1914* (Greece during the Balkan Wars, 1910-1914), Athens 1993, pp. 259-278.

4. Ibidem, p. 271.

5. Nadja Danova, “Les Bulgares vus par les intellectuels grecs à la fin du XVIIIe et au début du XIXe siècles”, published in the *Proceedings of the First Greek-Bulgarian Symposium* organised by the Institute of Balkan Studies and held in Thessaloniki on 22-25 of September 1978. Thessaloniki 1980, pp. 157-167; Gunnar Hering, “Die Bulgaren in den Schriften Griechischer Intellektueller in der ersten Hälfte des 19 Jahrhunderts”, in *Münchener Zeitschrift für Balkankunde* 3 (1980) 47-66.

6. N. Danova, *op.cit.*, p. 166.

7. I quote here the definition of the *Roum-Millet* given by the author of a Greek book published in 1815: “The Greeks, the Bulgarians, the Wallahians (= Romanians), the Serbians and the Albanians are in the present day Nations, each one having its own language. However, all these peoples and the others who live in the East form one Body and one Nation named *Γραικοί* or *Ρωμαίοι*, because they are united by the faith and the Church. Therefore, the Ottoman authorities when they have to address their subjects who are Orthodox Christians they call them *Ρωμαίοι* and they give to the Patriarche the name of *Πατριάρχης των Ρωμαίων*, but if they want to address one of these peoples separately, they use its own name” [*Απολογία ιστορική και κριτική υπέρ του ιερού κλήρου της Ανατολικής Εκκλησίας κατά των συκοφαντιών του Νεοφύτου Δούκα, συγγραφέα υπό Κυρίλλου Κ. (Historic and critical Confession on behalf of the Holy Clergy of the Eastern Church and against Neophytos Dpukas’ detraction, written by Cyril K.), (Πύξα) 1815, σ. 108].*

19th century<sup>8</sup>.

The opinion of the Greek scholars concerning the Bulgarians has not changed after the establishment of the independent Greek national state in 1830. On the contrary, till the middle of the 19th century the Bulgarians have been regarded always with the same affinity and spirit of conciliation, as in the past. My claim is confirmed by Constantinos Koumas, who wrote in 1832: "They (= the Bulgarians) are peasants, hardworking farmers, but ignorant and rough; I must exempt the townspeople who have been taught the greek language and they are distinguished from their noble morals. However, in their majority, they are honest people and stable in their faith in the Orthodox Church. They are directly under the ottoman domination and they share the fate of the other ottoman subjects"<sup>9</sup>.

As far as the Greek textbooks of history —and geography— used during the 19th century are concerned, Christina Koulouri published in 1988 a voluminous catalogue including an introduction with very interesting remarks<sup>10</sup>. Although in this work there are general references to the viewpoints of the Greek authors concerning the Bulgarians, Chr. Koulouri doesn't study this problem in detail, because it was not her main purpose.

So, in the present paper I intent to describe the way the authors of the Greek textbooks of history of the second half of the 19th century regarded the Bulgarians, in order to complete the historiography dedicated to this problem. Besides, it is worth mentioning here that this period of time was very critical for both the two peoples, because of the Greek-Bulgarian conflict, which broke out after 1870, due to the "Macedonian Question".

Beginning with the introduction of the first educational system in

8. In the first case the Greek education had religious character, while in the second it had a cosmopolitan one (see Κιτρομηλίδης, Π., *Το όραμα της ελευθερίας* (The vision for freedom), Athens 1992, pp. 17-18 and idem, *Ιώσηπος Μοισιόδαξ* (Joseph Moesiodax), Athens 1985, pp. 227-231).

9. *Ιστορία των Ανθρωπίνων Πράξεων* (History of the Human Deeds), vol. XII, Vienna 1832, p. 528.

10. *Ιστορία και γεωγραφία στα ελληνικά σχολεία (1834-1914). Γνωστικό αντικείμενο και ιδεολογικές προεκτάσεις. Ανθολόγιο κειμένων-Βιβλιογραφία σχολικών εγχειριδίων* [History and Geography in the Greek schools, 1834-1914. The subject and the ideological prospects. Text anthology-Bibliography of the school textbooks], Athens 1988.

Greece in 1834, I would like to point out that the references to the Bulgarians till the middle of the 19th century were very few and in some cases non-existent. This fact must be attributed to the following reasons:

1) During this period of time a turn towards the ancient Greece was ventured in an attempt to be proved that the modern Greeks are directly descendants of the ancient ones<sup>11</sup>. Therefore, the central authorities of the recently established Greek state imposed on public education the so-called “prevalence of the ancient Greek language”<sup>12</sup>. Consequently, the history curriculum was limited to ancient Greece<sup>13</sup>. Thus, the byzantine era was excluded from the textbooks of history<sup>14</sup> and no reference could be made to the Bulgarians, who had settled in the Balkans, as it is well known, during the 6th and the 7th centuries AD.

2) The roman and the byzantine era, according to the Greek scholars of the Greek Enlightenment, were considered to be periods of slavery and decline for Hellenism<sup>15</sup>. Therefore, the study of these two periods

11. Ghiorgos Veloudis, *O Jacob Philipp Falmerayer και η γένεση του ελληνικού ιστορισμού* (Jacob Philipp Falmerayer and the origins of the Greek historicism), Athens 1982, pp. 22-23 and Alexes Polites, *Ρομαντικά χρόνια. Ιδεολογίες και νοοτροπίες στην Ελλάδα του 1830-1880* (Years of romanticism. Ideologies and mentalities in Greece during the period 1830-1880), Athens 1993, pp. 32-33, 84-85 and 108-111.

12. Sephes Bouzakis, *Νεοελληνική Εκπαίδευση (1821-1985)* (The modern Greek education, 1821-1985), Athens 1987, p. 41 and Alexes Demaras, *Η μεταρρύθμιση που δεν έγινε* (The reformation that never happened), vol. I (1821-1894), Athens 1990, pp. κθ' - λ'.

13. Gh. Veloudis, *op.cit.*, p. 16 and Chr. Koulouri, *op.cit.*, p. 47. Cf. Chr. Koulouri, “Εθνικά στερεότυπα και ελληνική εθνική ταυτότητα στο σχολείο του 19ου αι. (National stereotypes and the greek national identity in the schools of the 19th century)”, in *Αφιέρωμα στον Πανεπιστημιακό Δάσκαλο Β. Βλ. Σφυρόερα*, Athens 1991, pp. 325-326.

14. Chr. Koulouri, *Ιστορία και γεωγραφία στα ελληνικά σχολεία*, pp. 36-39.

15. Adamantios Coraes, the well known scholar of the Greek Enlightenment, was the first Greek author who characterized the byzantine era as a period of decline for Hellenism [see for instance his essays entitled *Αδελφική Διδασκαλία* (Fraternal Teaching), Rome(?) 1798 (pp. 31-32) and *Διάλογος δύο Γραικών κατοίκων της Βενετίας*, (A dialogue between two Greek inhabitants of Venice) Venice 1805 (pp. 33 and 37-38)]. After the establishment of the Greek kingdom in 1833 Coraes' opinion was adopted by all the Greek scholars (see K. Th. Demaras, *Ελληνικός Ρομαντισμός* (The Greek romanticism), Athens 1982, pp. 339-340 and 379-382). It is worth mentioning here the opinion concerning Byzantium expressed by A. I. Antoniadis, who translated into greek G. Weber's work entitled *Übersicht der Weltgeschichte*. “The Byzantine Empire”, he wrote, “represents a typical example of moral corruption. Within the court, which had adopted the luxury and the easy life of the East, women and favourites were enthroning and dethroning weak and

was regarded as being needless.

3) The system of education introduced and applied in Greece by the Bavarians was soon proved to be unsuccessful and inapplicable<sup>16</sup>. So, in the schools of primary education the method of mutual teaching continued to be used till 1880<sup>17</sup>. The purpose of this method, as it is well known, was to give to the young students the elementary knowledge (reading, writing and calculating). This fact, however, minimised the importance of history as a separate subject<sup>18</sup>.

4) The history textbooks used at that period of time in the Greek schools were not written by Greek authors, but they were first published in Western Europe and translated into the Greek language<sup>19</sup>. These books anyhow contained very few references to the byzantine history<sup>20</sup>

malicious kings, while the powerful theologians of the palace had given to the political life a religious and ecclesiastic character. A corrupted guard was playing with the throne in such an insolent way as the Praetorian guard of the ancient Rome. The mob was surviving thanks to the distributions of grain and it was entertained by watching crude spectacles in the circus. However, the provinces were suffering because of the heavy taxation and the arbitrariness of the state employees, the agriculture was falling in decline and the commerce and the handicraft was destroyed because of the taxation and the state monopoly" (*Σύνοψις της Παγκοσμίου Ιστορίας*, Athens 1858, pp. 19-20).

16. S. Bouzakis, *op.cit.*, pp. 36 and 43-45.

17. *Ibidem*, pp. 37-38; Alexes Demaras, *Η μεταρρύθμιση που δεν έγινε*, vol. I, pp. μβ' and 244.

18. Chr. Koulouri, *Dimensions idéologiques de l'historicité en Grèce (1834-1914)*, Frankfurt am Main - Bern - N. York - Paris: Peterlang 1993, pp. 256-257.

19. *Idem*, *Ιστορία και γεωγραφία στα ελληνικά σχολεία*, pp. 23-25 and Gh. Veloudis, *op.cit.*, pp. 16-17.

20. According to the research I carried out the most known textbooks of that period contain the following number of pages dedicated to the Byzantine history: i) C. Paparrigopoulos, *Στοιχεία της Γενικής Ιστορίας κατά το σύστημα του Γάλλου Λεβί* (Elements of the General History according to Lévi's system), Athens 1845 (6 pages), ii) G. Gennadios, *Σύνοψις της Γενικής Ιστορίας* γερμανιστί συνταχθείσα υπό Α. Α. Καμμερέρου (A synopsis of the General History written in german by A. A. Kammerer), Athens 1853 (3 pages), iii) G. A. Vacalopoulos, *Γενική Ιστορία*, Μεταφρασθείσα εκ της δωδεκάτης εκδόσεως της επιτομής του Καθηγητού Γουλιέλμου Πυτσίου (General History, translation of the 12th edition of Professor's Wilhelm Pütz Synopsis), Athens 1861 (11 pages), iv) Sp. Antoniadis, *Σύνοψις της Καθολικής Ιστορίας*, διηρημένη εις μέρη τρία, αρχαίαν ιστορίαν, μέσην και νεωτέραν. Εκδοθείσα υπό του Άγγλου Ερρίκου Ουίτε (A synopsis of the General History, divided in three parts, ancient, medieval and modern history, published by Henry White), Athens 1865 (3 pages) v) D. Pantazes, *Σύνοψις ιστορίας της Ελλάδος από των αρχαιοτάτων χρόνων μέχρι των νεωτάτων (1820)* (Short history of Greece from the ancient times till 1820), Athens 1869 (7 pages), vi) D. Ch. Kyriakopoulos, *Ιστορία*

and even fewer to the Bulgarians.

This situation started to change after the middle of the 19th century, when Constantinos Paparrigopoulos, the founder of the Greek national historiography, published a synopsis entitled *History of the Greek Nation*<sup>21</sup>. In this work the Greek historian first expressed the opinion that Byzantium was the necessary bonding element which safeguarded the continuation of the Greek nation from antiquity to the 19th century<sup>22</sup>. Nevertheless, Paparrigopoulos, in order to prove his claim, maintained that the Byzantine Empire was in fact a Greek Empire. "The Greek nation", he wrote, "occupied by the Romans, did not lose its own language and customs, but it kept on spreading this language and customs throughout the East; thus the eastern part of the Roman Empire was completely hellenised; and as soon as the western part of the Roman Empire disintegrated, a separate kingdom remained in the East which, out of necessity, became Greek"<sup>23</sup>.

Approximately twenty years later Paparrigopoulos published his voluminous work entitled also *History of the Greek Nation*<sup>24</sup>. In this work he developed and completed the idea that Byzantium was a Greek Empire and consequently the byzantine history should be part of the

*Ελληνική από των αρχαιοτάτων χρόνων μέχρι Καποδιστρίου προς διδασκαλίαν εν τοις Γυμνασίοις* (Greek history from the ancient times till Kapodistria's arrival in Greece) (to be used by the students of the High School), Athens 1879 (23 pages) and vii) Ιakovos Dragatses, *Ρωμαϊκή ιστορία και του Μεσαιώνος τα κυριώτατα προς διδασκαλίαν εν Γυμνασίοις* (Roman history and the most important events of the Middle Ages) (to be used by the students of the High School), Athens 1881 (10 pages).

21. *Ιστορία του Ελληνικού Έθνους. Από των αρχαιοτάτων χρόνων μέχρι της σήμερον προς διδασκαλίαν των παιδων* (History of the Greek Nation from the ancient times till today), Athens 1853. Cf. K. Th. Demaras, *Κωνσταντίνος Παπαρρηγόπουλος. Η εποχή του - Η ζωή του - Το έργο του* (Constantinos Paparrighopoulos. His times - His life - His work), Athens 1986, pp. 171-174.

22. Spyridon Zampelios was the first Greek scholar who worded this opinion. However C. Paparrigopoulos was the first Greek *historian* who transformed this idea to a well founded theory [see K. Th. Demaras, *Ελληνικός ρωμαντισμός*, Athens 1994, pp. 376-379 and 460-471; idem, *Κωνσταντίνος Παπαρρηγόπουλος*, pp. 99, 172, 221-222, 278 passim].

23. *Op.cit.*, pp. 90-91.

24. *Ιστορία του Ελληνικού Έθνους από των αρχαιοτάτων χρόνων μέχρι των νεωτέρων* (History of the Greek Nation from the ancient to the modern times), vol. I-V, Athens 1860-1874. A very interesting account concerning the problems that Paparrigopoulos faced in order to publish his work see in K. Th. Demaras, *Κωνσταντίνος Παπαρρηγόπουλος*, pp. 221-234.

Greek national history. Therefore, the framework of the Greek history outlined by the scholars of the Greek Enlightenment at the beginning of the 19th century and adopted for different reasons by the authorities of the Greek state during the period 1833-1853 has radically changed.

At the same time the Greek Ministry of Education, in order to improve the old system of public education, elaborated in 1880 new analytical programmes for the schools of primary and secondary education<sup>25</sup> and prescribed the guidelines of the new textbooks. In the case of the history curricula, the new framework of the national history proposed by C. Paparrigopoulos and his adherents was adopted<sup>26</sup>. Under these circumstances, the textbooks of history “for the students’ use” ought to contain a special chapter dedicated either to the history of the Byzantine Empire or to the “eminent men of Byzantium”.

In spite of the changes mentioned above, the situation was improved much less than one would expect. According to the research I carried out, in a total number of 323 textbooks of history published from 1853 to 1900<sup>27</sup>, in which the reprintings and the revised editions are included, only 34 —that is 10.5%— contain sufficient references to the Byzantine

25. Al. Demaras, *op.cit.*, p. 241; Chr. Koulouri, *Ιστορία και γεωγραφία στα ελληνικά σχολεία*, pp. 263-267 and 389-393; David Antoniou, *Τα προγράμματα της Μέσης Εκπαίδευσης (1833-1929)* (The analytical programmes of the secondary education), Athens 1987, vol. I, pp. 243-256, 291-297, 310-340 and 341-374.

26. Chr. Koulouri, *Ιστορία και γεωγραφία στα ελληνικά σχολεία*, pp. 268-271, 319-321, 382-385, 433 and 446-449. According to the official announcement published by the Ministry of Education in 1882 the history ought to be taught as a separate subject in the so-called “Greek School” and in High School, that is in the secondary education. In the first case the history textbooks should contain “The history of the Greek nation till the death of Constantine the Great and from his death till the establishment of the kingdom of Greece related to the most important events of the history of other nations, if these nations had been related to the Greek one”. As far as High School is concerned the textbooks should contain the following: “i) The history of the Roman and the Byzantine Empire till the conquest of Constantinople by the crusaders, as well as the most important events of the World History. ii) The byzantine history till the fall of Constantinople in 1453, the medieval history of Western Europe and the modern history from renaissance to the establishment of the Greek kingdom. iii) The history of the Greek nation from the ancient times till today, which should summarize the most important events in order for the students to realize the spirit of Hellenism and the particular character of the Greek nation” (the announcement is published by Chr. Koulouri in *Ιστορία και γεωγραφία στα ελληνικά σχολεία.*, pp. 269-270; see also the titles of the textbooks which are included in the Appendix).

27. See the catalogue of the Greek textbooks of history published during that period of time in Chr. Koulouri’s work mentioned above (pp. 610-710).

Empire<sup>28</sup>. However even in these textbooks the authors usually dedicated to the byzantine history less than 20% of the total number of pages<sup>29</sup>.

As far as the authors of the history textbooks are concerned, I must point out that most of them were teachers of High School without any special studies in history<sup>30</sup>. Dimitrios Papatheodorou and Gheorghios Tsagres were the most known authors among those who published textbooks in which the byzantine era was sufficiently examined<sup>31</sup>. I also have to mention here Gheorghios Theophilos, who first published in 1864 a textbook totally dedicated to the history of the Byzantine Empire<sup>32</sup>.

The peculiar thing is that C. Paparrigopoulos, who first founded the new conception of the byzantine history, is not included among the authors of history textbooks. Despite the textbook published in 1853 and mentioned above, the most famous Greek historian did not publish any other textbook of history, but he just reprinted in 1888 the edition of 1853 without any improvement or addition<sup>33</sup>.

As far as the Bulgarians are concerned, it is impossible to examine here one by one all the references made to them by the Greek authors of the history textbooks published in the second half of the 19th century.

28. See the Appendix.

29. Chr. Koulouri, *Ιστορία και γεωγραφία στα ελληνικά σχολεία*, p. 45.

30. Usually the authors indicate their profession in the title of the textbooks they published. For instance Gh. Tsagres used the title "Principal of High School" and D. Papatheodorou signed the textbooks he published as "Professor of High School".

31. From 1886 till 1899 D. Papatheodorou published 18 textbooks and Gh. Tsagres 27 (see the catalogue of textbooks elaborated by Chr. Koulouri in her work *Ιστορία και γεωγραφία στα ελληνικά σχολεία*, no. 386, 416, 444, 445, 475, 500-502, 539-541, 563-565, 584, 588, 589, 604 and 389, 420-422, 450, 451, 478, 508, 532, 547-549, 569, 570-576, 586, 590, 591, 605-608).

32. *Επίτομος ιστορία της Βυζαντινής Αυτοκρατορίας*, Συλλεγείσα εκ διαφόρων ιστορικών πηγών υπό Γεωργίου Θεοφίλου Κυμαίου (A short history of the Byzantine Empire, Material collected from several historical sources by Gheorghios Theophilou), Athens 1864. The textbook was reprinted in 1877.

33. *Ιστορία του Ελληνικού Έθνους από των αρχαιοτάτων χρόνων μέχρι της σήμερον προς διδασκαλίαν των παιδων*, (History of the Greek Nation from the ancient times till the present day for students' use), Athens 1888 (230 p.). It seems that this textbook had been published in 1881 or 1882. The Committee of the Ministry of Education which reviewed this edition wrote in its report that "it is just a reprint of the first edition of 1853" (see the text in Chr. Koulouri's *Ιστορία και γεωγραφία στα ελληνικά σχολεία*, p. 285).



Thereby I consider more useful to mention here briefly the historical events related to the Bulgarians, which are described in the textbooks of that period of time. Based on the research I carried out, the Greek authors focused on the following historical events:

1) The first attack of the Bulgarians against Constantinople in 559 and their expulsion by Velissarios, the famous general of Emperor Justinian<sup>34</sup>.

2) The settlement of the Bulgarians in northern Thrace—that is the area between the Danube river and Haimos (Balkan) mountains—during the reign of Emperor Constantinos Pogonatos the IV and the establishment of the first Bulgarian kingdom in 681.

3) The wars carried out by the Emperor Constantinos Isavros (741-775) against the Bulgarians.

4) Emperor Nikephoros' the Ist expedition against the Bulgarians in 811 and the victory of the Bulgarian king Kroumos. In the textbooks Kroumos' atrocious deed is described in detail, who beheaded the Emperor, he silver-plated the skull and used it as a cup.

5) The unsuccessful expedition against the Bulgarians organised by Emperor Michael Rangave in 813 and Emperor Leo's the Vth the Armenian victory, which had as a result a peace treaty to be signed between the Byzantine Empire and the Bulgarian kingdom (815).

6) The christianization of the Bulgarians in 864 thanks to "Methodius and Kyrillus, the two brothers who were Greek monks", as it is characteristically mentioned in most of the textbooks.

7) The establishment by Symeon of the great medieval Bulgarian state at the end of the 9th century and the compative battles with the byzantine army under the command of Emperor Romanos Lekapenos (920-924).

8) Emperor Ioannes Tsimiskes' expedition in Bulgaria in 971 against the Russians, who, under the leadership of Sviatoslav, invaded and occupied the Bulgarian lands. This expedition had as a result the abolition of the Bulgarian kingdom and the annexation of its territory to "the Byzantine Empire as one of its provinces".

9) The "revolt" of the Bulgarians under the command of king Samuel in 985 and the re-establishment of the Bulgarian kingdom. The long

34. I must notice here that this event is not mentioned in all the textbooks I studied.

lasting wars against the Bulgarians carried out by the Emperor Basil the II<sup>nd</sup>, which ended once again with the shattering of the Bulgarians and the annexation of the Bulgarian lands to the Byzantine Empire. It is worth mentioning here that almost all the authors of the textbooks made reference to the atrocious deed of the Byzantine Emperor, who after the last battle in 1014 ordered for all the Bulgarian prisoners to be blinded, that is approximately 15.000 men.

10) The “revolt” of the Bulgarians in 1186 during the reign of Emperor Isaakios Anghelos and the establishment of the “second” Bulgarian kingdom by the dynasty of Asanides, which played an important role in the Balkan Peninsula during the 13th and 14th century.

More interesting is the way the Greek authors used to describe and criticize the historical events mentioned above. Based on the study of the textbooks of history published in the second half of the 19th century, I have to underline here the following:

1) The historical events were described without significant difference in comparison with the results of the contemporary historiography<sup>35</sup>. If we neglect some common mistakes regarding the dates, the authors of the textbooks did not attempt any conscientious falsification of the historical truth.

2) There are no negative stereotypes in the textbooks concerning the Bulgarians. On the contrary, in some cases the authors even try to justify the hostile attitude of the Bulgarians towards the Byzantine Empire. D. Papatheodorou, for instance, describing the expedition of Emperor Nikephoros the I<sup>st</sup> to the Bulgarian lands noted: “However, his (= Nikephoros’) *great cruelty* led the Bulgarian king Kroumos in such a despair, so as to continue the fight...”<sup>36</sup>. Gregorios Kambouroglou, the author of a textbook published in 1896, is the only exception, as far as I know; refering to the Byzantine Emperor Basil the II<sup>nd</sup>, he wrote: “The name of this emperor is strongly associated with the destruction of the

35. I drew the comparison using the following studies: J. M. Hussey (ed.), *The Cambridge Medieval History*, vol. IV, Part I: *Byzantium and its neighbours*, translated into greek by Dudu Saul, Athens 1979; J. Karayannopoulos, *To βυζαντινό κράτος* (The byzantine state), vol. II (324-1453), Athens 1988; Georg Ostrogorsky *Geschichte des byzantinischen Staates*, translated into greek by Ioannis Panagopoulos, vol. I-III, Athens 1995.

36. *Γενική Ιστορία*, vol. III which contains the history of the Middle Ages, Athens 1892, pp. 75-76.

Bulgarians, a tribe which (except for the Arabs) was hazardous for the existence of Europe and its civilisation”<sup>37</sup>.

3) Despite the fact that after 1870 a conflict broke out between the Greeks and the Bulgarians due to the so-called “Macedonian Question”<sup>38</sup>, which became worse after 1878, the authors of the textbooks of history did not issue any evaluative judgements concerning the Bulgarian people and they did not make any insinuations about this conflict. It seems that the ever-growing Greek nationalism of that period had not influenced the authors of the textbooks of history yet<sup>39</sup>.

The conclusions to be drawn are the following: 1) The references to the Bulgarians in the Greek textbooks of history appeared after 1853 and became more frequent and detailed in the textbooks published during the last two decades of the 19th century, 2) the Bulgarians were not studied as a people in their own right, but they were directly related to the history of the Byzantine Empire, 3) the Bulgarian people was not considered anymore to be “brothers” of the Greeks and 4) the Greek textbooks of history published during the last two decades of the 19th century, except for some isolated cases, contain no negative stereotypes

37. *Βίοι επιφανών ανδρών της Ρώμης, του Βυζαντίου και του δουλεύσαντος Ελληνικού Έθνους* προς χρήσιν των μαθητών της Β΄ τάξεως του Ελληνικού Σχολείου (The life of eminent men of Rome, Byzantium and the enslaved Greek nation) (to be used by the students of the Second Class of the “Greek School”, Athens 1896, p. 61.

38. The bibliography concerning this problem is very extensive. So I prefer to quote here Fikret Adanir’s work entitled *Die Makedonische Frage. Ihre Entstehung und Entwicklung bis 1908* (Wiesbaden 1979), which contains a rich bibliography of studies in international and balkan languages.

39. On the contrary, the authors of the Greek textbooks of geography published in the same period of time had adopted a hostile attitude towards the Bulgarian people, because of the “Macedonian Question” (see Chr. Koulouri, *Ιστορία και γεωγραφία στα ελληνικά σχολεία*, pp. 71-75 and idem, *Dimensions idéologiques*, pp. 444-445). It is worth mentioning here Ch. P. Oeconomou’s viewpoint, who published in 1886 a textbook of geography: “The Bulgarians ... make demands upon Macedonia and Thrace, proclaim themselves to be the descendants of Alexander the Great and they work hard to achieve the annexation of Macedonia and Thrace to Bulgaria. That’s why they are the most dangerous enemies of the Greeks” (The extract is published by Chr. Koulouri in *Ιστορία και γεωγραφία στα ελληνικά σχολεία*, p. 325). Nevertheless, the same attitude towards the Bulgarians was adopted by the authors of historical and geographical essays published in Greece during the second half of the 19th century [see Alexes Polites, “Η διαφοροποίηση της ελληνικής στάσης απέναντι στους Βούλγαρους στα μέσα του 19ου αιώνα” (The change of the greek attitude towards the Bulgarians in the middle of the 19th century), published in *Η Αριστερά σήμερα*, issue no. 8 (September-October 1984), pp. 58-62].

concerning the Bulgarians.

This objective, to a certain point, attitude towards the Bulgarian people adopted by the authors of the Greek history textbooks of that period of time must be attributed, in my opinion, first of all to the influence of the German School of positivism<sup>40</sup>. According to this method the authors of history books based on the historical sources had to describe the historical events as “they really happened”, avoiding the interpretations and the commentaries.

On the other hand, the Greek authors of history textbooks, as the Greek historiography was not developed yet<sup>41</sup>, continued during that period of time to use as sources the historical studies published in Western Europe. However, the West European historians had no special reasons to regard the Bulgarian —or the Greek— people in a negative way, because they were not emotionally influenced by the Greek-

40. G. Veloudes, *op.cit.*, p. 8 (note) and 24-25. It is worth mentioning here I. Pantazides' opinion about the influence of the German positivism. In his essay entitled *Γυμνασιακή Παιδαγωγική* (Pedagogy for High School), which was published in Athens in 1889, he wrote: “History. This subject was introduced in the programme of our schools after our national emancipation imitating the german model ... However there (= in Germany), since they decided to introduce the teaching of history, the teachers and the authors (= of the textbooks) tried to spread historical knowledge according to a certain method and a new system. The critical character of this method led the authors to study the historic events and the lifes of the men who played an important role in the national history... However this method because of the detailed studying of the historic events annihilated their remarkable national character and destroyed their educational substance. Maybe the critical method by using this detailed research has found the (historical) truth, but this truth, which should be taught in the Universities ... is better to be hidden from the students of High School, in order for the moral benefit of the tradition in which they have believed for a long period of time not to be vanished”. And he concluded as follows: “It is better for the students of High School to be taught the history of their fatherland ... especially the admirable and the remarkable deeds [of their ancestors]... in a chronological order... because they cannot understand the causative relationship between the historic events” (The extracts are published by Chr. Koulouri in *Ιστορία και γεωγραφία στα ελληνικά σχολεία*, pp. 355-356 and 359).

41. It is a common belief today that the Greek national historiography started to develop after 1875, when C. Paparrigopoulos published the last volume of his remarkable work *History of the Greek Nation* [D. Zakythenos, “Μεταβυζαντινή και Νεωτέρα ελληνική ιστοριογραφία” (Postbyzantine and modern Greek Historiography), in the *Πρακτικά της Ακαδημίας Αθηνών* (Proceedings of the Academy of Athens), vol. 49 (1975) 102-103; G. Veloudis, *op.cit.*, p. 78; Al. Kitroeff, “Continuity and change in contemporary Greek historiography”, in M. Blinkhorn and Th. Veremis (eds.), *Modern Greece: Nationalism and Nationality*, Athens 1990, p. 143].

Bulgarian conflict for Macedonia.

The third factor which determined the attitude of the authors of the history textbooks towards the Bulgarian people were the new criteria in the writing of the textbooks which were introduced by the Greek scholars who played an important role to the revision of the Greek educational system after 1880. Due to the fact that these scholars had studied in Germany, they were deeply influenced by the German pedagogical methods and the German spirit<sup>42</sup>. Therefore the official view-point concerning the history curricula adopted by the Greek Ministry of Education remained devoid of the ever growing Greek nationalism and the antibulgarian spirit observed after 1878 due to the Greek-Bulgarian conflict for Macedonia. So, according to the official announcements published by the Ministry during the last two decades of the 19th century, the authors of the history textbooks had to describe with the necessary precision the historical events, as well as to strengthen the national conscience of the young students by references to the virtues of their ancestors, their brave deeds and their misfortunes<sup>43</sup>. However, they were not allowed to dispraise the other nations and especially those who at a particular historical juncture and for several reasons happened to be opponents of the Greek nation<sup>44</sup>.

The final conclusion I reached while studying the Greek textbooks of history published in the second half of the 19th century is that they do not contain —with the exception of isolated cases— negative stereotypes concerning the Bulgarian people. This situation began to change at the beginning of the 20th century and especially after the Balkan Wars of 1912-1913, when the textbooks of history became the means of a chauvinistic propaganda<sup>45</sup>. Starting with that period of time the Bulgarian people became the “eternal enemy” of the Greeks and remained so till 1974.

42. Charisios Papamarkou, Panaghiotes Oeconomou and Spyridon Moraites were the most important adherents of the new pedagogical methods introduced in Greece after 1880 [see Th. D. Chadjistefanides, *Ιστορία της νεοελληνικής εκπαίδευσης* (History of the modern Greek education), Athens 1986, pp. 73-87].

43. Chr. Koulouri, *Ιστορία και γεωγραφία στα ελληνικά σχολεία*, p. 79.

44. *Ibidem*, p. 75.

45. “The school textbooks of all kind”, wrote D. Glenos in his essay, “reached the culmination of chauvinism and national antagonism between 1914 and 1917” (Ph. Eliou, *op.cit.*, p. 277).

## APPENDIX

*Note:* The following catalogue contains the 34 textbooks of history published during the second half of the 19th century which contain sufficient references to the byzantine era and consequently to the Bulgarian people. The total number of the textbooks listed includes the reprintings. I couldn't find the textbooks marked with \*, because they are missing.

- 1) S. Androutsos - A. T. Basias, *Επίτομος ιστορία των Ελλήνων από της αρχής αυτών μέχρι των καθ' ημάς χρόνων* (A short history of the Greeks from their origins till today) ... προς χρήσιν των μαθητών της Γ' τάξεως του Ελληνικού Σχολείου (to be used by the students of the 3rd class of the "Greek School"), Athens 1897.
- 2) Antonios I. Antoniadis, *Εγχειρίδιον της παγκοσμίου ιστορίας* (Manual of the World history) ... Τόμος Γ', Τεύχος Α', Περιέχον την ιστορίαν του Μεσαιώνος και της Ελληνικής Αυτοκρατορίας (Vol. III, Issue 1, History of the middle Ages and of the Greek Empire), Athens 1892<sup>7</sup>.
- 3) Gregorios Kambouroglou, *Βίοι επιφανών ανδρών της Ρώμης, του Βυζαντίου και του δουλεύσαντος Ελληνικού Έθνους* (The life of eminent men of Rome, Byzantium and the enslaved Greek Nation) ... προς χρήσιν των μαθητών της Β' τάξεως του Ελληνικού Σχολείου (to be used by the students of the 2nd class of the "Greek School"), Athens 1896.
- 4) Evangelos Papachatzis, *Ιστορία Ελληνική από της εις τους Ρωμαίους υποταγής των Ελλήνων μέχρι τέλους του παρελθόντος αιώνα* (The Greek history from the conquest of Greece by the Romans till the last century), προς χρήσιν της Ε' τάξεως του πλήρους δημοτικού σχολείου (to be used by the pupils of the 5th class of the six years elementary school), Athens 1896.
- 5) Constantinos Paparrigopoulos, *Ιστορία του Ελληνικού Έθνους από των αρχαιοτάτων χρόνων μέχρι της σήμερον* (History of the Greek Nation from the ancient times till today), προς διδασκαλίαν των παιδων (For the students' use), Athens 1853 (reprinted in 1881, 1888 and 1896).
- 6) Demetrios Papatheodorou, *Επίτομος ιστορία του Ελληνικού έθνους μετά των σπουδαιωτάτων γεγονότων της παγκοσμίου ιστορίας* (A short history of the Greek Nation including the most important events of the World History), προς χρήσιν των μαθητών της Γ' τάξεως των Ελληνικών Σχολείων (to be used by the students of the 3rd class of the "Greek School"), Athens 1888.
- 7) Idem, *Γενική ιστορία* διηρημένη εις τέσσαρας τόμους κατά το πρόγραμμα του Υπουργείου της Παιδείας, Τόμος Τρίτος περιέχων την ιστορίαν των

- μέσων χρόνων και των νέων μέχρι της Βεστφαλικής ειρήνης (1648) (General history divided in four volumes according to the programme of the Ministry of Education, vol. III, Medieval and modern history till the peace treaty of Westfalia in 1648), προς χρήσιν των μαθητών της Γ' τάξεως των Γυμνασίων (to be used by the students of the 3rd class of the High School), Athens 1892.
- 8) Idem, *Ιστορία του Ρωμαϊκού Κράτους και του Βυζαντιακού* (History of the Roman and Byzantine Empire), προς χρήσιν των μαθητών της Β' τάξεως των Γυμνασίων (to be used by the students of the 2nd class of the High School), Έκδοσις δευτέρα μετεσκευασμένη (2nd revised edition), Athens 1895.
- 9) Idem, *Επιτομή της Ελληνικής ιστορίας* (A short Greek history), προς χρήσιν των μαθητών της Γ' τάξεως των Ελληνικών Σχολείων (to be used by the students of the 3rd class of the "Greek School"), Έκδοσις τρίτη μετεσκευασμένη (3rd revised edition), Athens 1895 (reprinted in 1896 and 1897).
- 10) Idem, *Βίοι επιφανών ανδρών της Ρώμης, του Βυζαντίου και του δουλεύσαντος Ελληνικού έθνους* (The life of eminent men of Rome, Byzantium and the enslaved Greek Nation), προς χρήσιν των μαθητών της Β' τάξεως των Ελληνικών Σχολείων και των μαθητριών των Παρθεναγωγείων (to be used by the students of the 2nd class of the "Greek School" and the students of the Girls' School), Athens 1896.
- 11) Idem, *Ιστορία από του Μεγάλου Κωνσταντίνου μέχρι του 1453 μετά των κυριωτάτων γεγονότων της ιστορίας της Δύσεως κατά τον Μέσον Αιώνα* (History from Constantine the Great till 1453 including the most important events of the history of Western Europe during the Middle Ages), χάριν των μαθητών της Β' τάξεως των Γυμνασίων και Παρθεναγωγείων (to be used by the students of the 2nd class of the High School and the Girls' School), Έκδοσις τετάρτη (4th edition), Athens 1898.
- 12) Epaminondas Phranghistas, *Ελληνική ιστορία από του Μεγάλου Κωνσταντίνου μέχρις Όθωνος* (Greek history from Constantine the Great till king Otto), προς χρήσιν των μαθητών των Γυμνασίων (to be used by the students of the High School), Τόμος Β', Έκδοσις Δευτέρα (Vol. II, 2nd edition), Athens 1886 (reprinted in 1892).
- 13) \*Idem, *Επιτομή της ιστορίας των Ελλήνων από της αρχής αυτών μέχρι των καθ' ημάς χρόνων* (A short history of the Greeks from their very beginning till the present times) ... προς χρήσιν της Γ' τάξεως των Ελληνικών Σχολείων (to be used by the students of the 3rd class of the "Greek School"), Athens 1896.

- 14) Gheorghios Theophilos, *Επίτομος ιστορία της Βυζαντινής Αυτοκρατορίας*. Συλλεγείσα εκ διαφόρων ιστορικών πηγών υπό ... (A short history of the Byzantine Empire, Material collected from several historical sources by Gh. Theophilou), Athens 1864 (reprinted in 1877).
- 15) \*Gheorghios Tsagres, *Ιστορία των μέσων και νεωτέρων χρόνων από του διχασμού του Ρωμαϊκού Κράτους μέχρι τέλους του τριακονταετούς πολέμου (395-1648) και ιστορία του Βυζαντιακού Κράτους από του διχασμού του Ρωμαϊκού Κράτους μέχρι της αλώσεως της Κωνσταντινουπόλεως υπό των Τούρκων (395-1453)* [Medieval and modern history from the division of the Roman Empire till the end of the thirty years war (395-1648); history of the Byzantine Empire from the division of the Roman Empire till the fall of Constantinople (395-1453)], Athens 1891.
- 16) Idem, *Βίοι επιφανών ανδρών της Ρώμης, του Βυζαντίου και του δουλεύσαντος Ελληνικού Έθνους* (The lives of eminent men of Rome, Byzantium and the enslaved Greek Nation), προς χρήσιν των μαθητών της Β' τάξεως των Ελληνικών Σχολείων (to be used by the students of the 2nd class of the "Greek School"), Athens 1894 (reprinted in 1896).
- 17) \*Idem, *Ιστορία των Ρωμαίων και του Βυζαντινού Κράτους διά τα Γυμνάσια* (History of the Roman and Byzantine Empire for the students of the High School), Athens 1895 (reprinted in 1896?).
- 18) Idem, *Ιστορία Ελληνική από της υποταγής της Ελλάδος υπό τους Ρωμαίους μέχρι της αλώσεως της Κωνσταντινουπόλεως υπό των Τούρκων (ήτοι από του 146 π.Χ. μέχρι του 1453 μ.Χ.)* (Greek history from the conquest of Greece by the Romans till the Fall of Constantinople, that is from 146 B.C. till 1453), διά την Ζ' τάξιν του Αρσακείου και των Παρθεναγωγείων (to be used by the students of the 7th class of the Girls' School), Athens 1899.
- 19) \*Idem, *Ιστορία του Βυζαντιακού κράτους και του δουλεύσαντος ελληνικού έθνους* (History of the Byzantine Empire and the enslaved Greek Nation) ... διά την Ε' τάξιν των πλήρων δημοτικών σχολείων (to be used by the students of the 5th class of the six years elementary school), Athens 1899.
- 20) Socrates Tsivanopoulos, *Ιστορία της Ελλάδος από της κτίσεως της Κωνσταντινουπόλεως μέχρι της ιδρύσεως του βασιλείου της Ελλάδος* (History of Greece from the foundation of Constantinople till the establishment of the kingdom of Greece) ... προς χρήσιν της Γ' τάξεως των Ελληνικών Σχολείων (to be used by the students of the 3rd class of the "Greek School"), Athens 1885 (reprinted in 1887).
- 21) \*Gherassimos VANDOROS, *Βίοι επιφανών ανδρών της Ρώμης, του Βυζαντινού*



ντίου και του δουλεύσαντος Ελληνισμού (The life of eminent men of Rome, Byzantium and the enslaved Greeks) ... προς χρήσιν της Β' τάξεως των Ελληνικών Σχολείων (to be used by the students of the 2nd class of the "Greek School"), Athens 1896.

- 22) Th. Venizelos - A. Spathakis, *Ιστορία Ρωμαϊκή και Βυζαντιακή* ( Roman and Byzantine History) προς χρήσιν των μαθητών της Β' τάξεως των Γυμνασίων (to be used by the students of the 2nd class of the High School), Athens 1894.
- 23) Constantinos Zachariades, *Στοιχειώδης ιστορία Ρωμαϊκή και Βυζαντινή* (Elementary History of the Roman and Byzantine Empire), 3rd edition, Athens 1884 (reprinted in 1886).